

SEEN BUT NOT HEARD

TEACHERS' VOICE IN RWANDA



A POLICY RESEARCH REPORT ON TEACHER MORALE AND MOTIVATION IN RWANDA

VSO RWANDA
VALUING TEACHERS



Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Acknowledgements | 3 |
| Acronyms and abbreviations | 4 |
| Executive summary | 5 |
| Introduction | 9 |
| Project rationale: international | 9 |
| Project rationale: in Rwanda | 10 |
| Research methodology in Rwanda | 10 |
| Contextual information | 11 |
| Teacher motivation in Rwanda | 14 |
| Chapter 1: Terms and conditions | 16 |
| Salary | 16 |
| Non-salary incentives | 17 |
| Policy on incentives | 19 |
| Chapter 2: Supporting enhanced performance | 20 |
| Teaching and learning materials | 20 |
| Training | 21 |
| School infrastructure | 21 |
| Class size | 22 |
| Personal life factors | 22 |
| Chapter 3: School-level management | 23 |
| Teacher-administration relationships | 23 |
| Promotion and training | 23 |
| Accountability and transparency | 23 |
| Appreciation | 23 |
| Consultation and communication | 24 |
| Policy on school-level management | 24 |
| Chapter 4: Community integration and social status | 25 |
| Negative attitudes towards teachers | 25 |
| Acknowledging teachers as nurturing role models | 25 |
| Lack of support from parents and the community | 26 |
| Policy on community integration | 26 |
| Chapter 5: Strengthening the system | 28 |
| Managing change | 28 |
| Capacity-building for decentralisation | 28 |
| Communication | 29 |
| Financing | 29 |
| Summary of teachers' needs for a stronger education system | 29 |
| Chapter 6: Communication and accountability | 31 |
| Communicating policy to teachers | 31 |
| Greater involvement for teachers in decision-making | 32 |
| Voices for teachers' views | 32 |
| Communication among all stakeholders | 33 |
| Summary of teachers' needs for improved communication and accountability | 33 |
| Conclusion and recommendations | 34 |
| Recommendations | 34 |
| Bibliography | 36 |
| Appendix 1: Focus group plans | 37 |
| Appendix 2: Surveys | 39 |
| Appendix 3: Stakeholders' meeting – attendance and programme | 45 |
| Appendix 4: Inputs and outputs | 46 |

Acknowledgements

| | |
|----------|--|
| Research | Reed Thomas; Ruth Mbabazi |
| Text | Reed Thomas |
| Editing | Lucy Tweedie; Phil Hudson; Rachel Bishop; Veronique Serafinowicz |
| Design | VSO Creative Services |

The researchers would like to express thanks to all individuals who willingly discussed their thoughts, experiences and suggestions during the course of this research – through interviews and at the stakeholders' meeting held in November 2003, as well as the 95 teachers and teacher trainees who participated anonymously in focus group discussions.

The views expressed in this report are representative of individuals who participated in the research and may not necessarily reflect the views of VSO Rwanda or VSO International.

Acronyms and abbreviations

| | |
|---------|---|
| ADRA | Adventist Development and Relief Agency |
| CfBT | Centre for British Teachers |
| CFJ | Centres de Formation des Jeunes (youth training centres) |
| EFA | Education For All |
| ESP | Education Sector Policy |
| ESR | Education Sector Review |
| ESSP | Education Sector Strategic Plan |
| FGD | focus group discussion |
| ICT | Information and communications technology |
| INGO | international non-governmental organisation |
| INSET | in-service education and training |
| KIE | Kigali Institute of Education |
| MINEDUC | Ministry of Education |
| MTEF | Medium Term Expenditure Framework |
| NCDC | National Curriculum Development Centre |
| NEC | National Examinations Council |
| NGO | non-governmental organisation |
| NUR | National University of Rwanda |
| PTA | Parent-Teacher Association |
| RAMA | Rwandaise d'assurance maladie (health care insurance system for teachers) |
| RwF | Rwandan Franc |
| SNEC | S cretariat National de l'Enseignement Catholique |
| SNEP | Syndicat National des Enseignants du Primaire |
| SWAp | sector-wide approach |
| TLMs | teaching and learning materials |
| TTC | teacher training college |
| UNILAK | Universit  Advantiste Laic de Kigali |
| UPE | Universal Primary Education |
| VVOB | Vlaamse Vereniging voor Ontwikkelingssamenwerking en Technische Bijstand (Flemish association for development cooperation and technical assistance) |
| WBGR | World Bank/Government of Rwanda |

Executive summary

‘Every person should know that a teacher is the pillar of sustainable development.’ (Future primary male school teacher)

During the World Education Forum on Education For All (EFA) at Dakar in April 2000, one theme that emerged was that access to education has overshadowed quality in the push for Universal Basic Education in developing countries. It is well known that a major determinant of improved educational experience and outcomes is the quality of teaching, and there is much interest among policy-makers in improving teacher performance. Yet crucially, understanding of teachers’ own attitudes to their profession is poor. VSO’s experience, backed by desk-based and field research, suggests that if teachers are to be effective as the main deliverers of educational reform in the coming decade, significant investments in improving their motivation and professionalism are essential.

‘Valuing Teachers’, an international VSO advocacy initiative, is a response to volunteers’ and nationals’ feedback identifying teachers’ motivation as a major obstacle to providing quality education. This research-based advocacy project seeks to identify and analyse the factors that affect teachers’ motivation, and particularly how this is linked to performance.

VSO is an international development charity that has been working through volunteers since 1958. It has been active in education in Rwanda since 1998 when the Ministry of Education (MINEDUC), as the primary partner organisation for VSO Rwanda, invited volunteers to support the post-genocide rebuilding of the education system.

Given VSO’s unique way of working through volunteers, it is well placed as an organisation to undertake research such as the ‘Valuing Teachers’ project. For instance, VSO is not a donor organisation, and it is one of the few non-faith-based international agencies working in the secondary education system (VSO, 2003). Ongoing involvement at school level means that this research has been undertaken with a solid background knowledge of the realities in schools.

The main questions of the research were as follows:

1. How do teachers feel generally about their work? What is the level of professional motivation?
2. What makes teachers happy? What makes teaching easier?
3. What makes teachers unhappy? What makes teaching more difficult?
4. What can be done? What can be improved?

These questions were addressed through a participatory research process¹, which included a variety of contacts with a wide range of stakeholders. It revealed that although working with students can be rewarding, teachers find their work difficult. Their motivation levels are strongly affected by the following factors:

- financial difficulties
- lack of support and tools for improving professional performance
- unsupportive management
- a perception that they are not valued by society.

Teachers can be resourceful in creating or sharing resources when they are motivated to do so. The home–school relationship improves when teachers are respected and feel part of the community. Finally, when these inputs and outputs occur in an atmosphere of transparent communication and accountability, teachers’ trust in the system stimulates their performance. The act of teaching, that is to say classroom work, becomes its own reward.

¹ The research process is outlined in a VSO toolkit called *START — Simple Toolkit for Advocacy Research Techniques*

However, the research showed that the factors highlighted above have caused teachers' motivation in Rwanda to become increasingly fragile. The feelings of being neglected, ignored and even scorned by authorities and society are beginning to outweigh the positive moments with students. Furthermore, teachers, and other stakeholders, feel these numerous challenges do affect their classroom work.

Yet the situation is not hopeless. Recent government policies contain positive commitments to support teachers. It is also clear from further analysis of the policy documents that the problem lies in the implementation not in the policies themselves. Therefore if these policies are implemented in a communicative and timely way, and if teachers begin to feel valued in Rwandan society, then teachers will regain their sense of vocation, be motivated to stay in teaching and perform their duties to the best of their abilities. This report sets out recommendations for priority actions, based on the research findings, in six main themes:

1. Terms and conditions
2. Supporting enhanced performance
3. School-level management
4. Community integration and social status
5. Strengthening the system
6. Communication and accountability.

1. Terms and conditions

It is clear that teachers' motivation is undermined when they feel they are insufficiently recompensed for their efforts, and when administrative breakdowns mean they cannot even access what they are entitled to.

Recommendations

- Improve the remuneration package for teachers, including salary and non-salary benefits such as health insurance, transport provision and accommodation.
- Overhaul the administration of salaries – as a gesture of goodwill, immediately pay all due backpay.
- Research and implement an equitable incentive scheme, to incorporate salary and non-salary aspects.

2. Supporting enhanced performance

Teachers say their motivation improves when they feel enabled to do the job. If they do not have the tools and training to support their performance, they do not have a sense of job satisfaction deriving from a successful teaching and learning interaction with pupils.

Recommendations

- Secure access to teaching and learning materials (TLMs):
 - Implement the national policy on textbook provision.
 - Improve management and organisation in provision of TLMs.
 - Increase schools' own budget for TLMs.
- Provide timely and appropriate training to teachers:
 - Train teachers in use of TLMs.
 - Improve the quality of in-service education and training (INSET) and teacher training.
 - Provide better and more pre-service training to produce qualified teachers through revised National Curriculum Development Centre (NCDC) curriculum.
- Create the right conditions for teaching:
 - Ensure national exams match the curriculum.
 - Improve facilities at school level through devolved budgets.

3. School-level management

The role of the headteacher, especially in a country like Rwanda, is key to supporting teachers in their work, building strong relationships with the community, and providing a link between the teacher and educational authorities.

Recommendations

- Design and implement a clear promotional system to develop a cadre of high-quality professional headteachers for the future.
- Prioritise and implement management training for headteachers in accordance with Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) policy commitments, incorporating:
 - a strong component of accountability and transparency practice
 - budgeting at school level.

4. Community integration and social status

Teachers in Rwanda feel strongly that they are held in low regard by the communities in which they live and by society at large. This seriously affects their motivation.

Recommendations

- Senior government figures should demonstrate political leadership by making supportive statements about teachers' key role in education and in the development of the nation.
- The media must be proactive about supporting teachers and creating positive images of teachers in society.
- Unions should provide better representation of teachers in all public spheres.
- To support decentralisation, MINEDUC should set up a fund for community/school relationship building.
- To strengthen the Parent-Teacher Associations (PTAs) being put in place under decentralisation, MINEDUC should:
 - employ a designated officer to be responsible for building better PTAs
 - improve networks and communication among stakeholders to establish more local-level
 - participation and trust in education.

5. Strengthening the system

Rwanda is undergoing a period of far-reaching and potentially transformative change in education, much of which is admirable and welcome. However, it is clear that reform priorities do not always respond to teachers' needs, and that they experience difficulties associated with planning and communication, which they attribute to systemic weakness.

Recommendations

- Manage and define the decentralisation processes to enable more effective service and local decision-making.
- Ensure administrative decentralisation is accompanied by capacity-building at all levels to ensure responsibilities are fulfilled.
- Clarify roles and responsibilities throughout the education system and communicate these to headteachers and teachers.
- Establish clear procedures for consultation with teachers and their associations.

Change is costly. While the Rwandan Government has made it clear that education is a priority, further funds are needed to improve quality and access in education.

Recommendations

- Government of Rwanda to continue to increase education budget on a year-on-year basis until the EFA goals are achieved.
- Donors to increase aid to education in Rwanda through appropriately harmonised efforts.
- Donors to pay recurrent costs and implement direct budget support modalities as soon as feasible.

6. Communication and accountability

Teachers feel alienated from reform processes when they are not able to participate in decisions, when they have no access to information about processes or plans, and therefore cannot hold decision-makers to account.

Recommendations

- Build the capacity of MINEDUC officials around monitoring and evaluation systems.
- Include in teachers decision-making processes through clear consultations processes.
- Establish communication systems to include and inform teachers of reforms.
- Strengthen inspectorate services to communicate among levels of education system.
- Establish monitoring and accountability systems to ensure transparent access to information about how decisions are reached and implemented.
- Strengthen the union to identify and communicate teachers' needs through this and further research and strong communication networks, and embrace them as full partners in EFA efforts.

Teachers should not be seen as mere 'inputs' in the delivery of quality education. To ensure commitment, motivation and high-quality classroom performance, teachers' remuneration issues, management and professional support and training must be addressed. Furthermore, it is clear that policy-makers must take the teachers' voice into account in planning and decision-making to ensure educational reforms do not founder on the lack of value and support that teachers feel they receive within the education system.

Introduction

This report on teaching in Rwanda does not begin in 1994. It begins today, or any workday, in any school, on any hill in this land of a thousand hills. It is 8am and students are lining up to enter the classroom. The teachers greet them. This is the time of the day when teachers feel most optimistic. Overwhelmingly, teachers who participated in this research cited working with children and educating others as being the most rewarding thing about their work. In spite of the many challenges in education today, they appreciate their role in the future of these children. The early morning represents a beginning, full of possibilities.

'Teaching is a noble profession: as soon as you launch yourself into it, you gain a lot. This is the reason that each year is compared to the last, and I think that everyone wants to improve.' (Male secondary school teacher)

Project rationale: international

'Every person should know that a teacher is the pillar of sustainable development.' (Male future primary school teacher)

VSO is an international development charity that works through volunteers. Since 1958, its experience in education has spanned geographical and chronological distances. 'Valuing Teachers', an international VSO advocacy initiative, is a response to volunteers' and nationals' feedback identifying teachers' motivation as a major obstacle to providing quality education in developing countries.

'Valuing Teachers' seeks to identify and analyse the factors that affect teachers' motivation, and particularly how this is linked to performance. Teacher motivation, in the widest sense, can be expressed as the way teachers feel about their work as educators. It is influenced not only by remuneration and other incentives, but by workload, being supported to perform well, management and value in society. Motivation has a direct impact on performance and is therefore an essential ingredient in the provision of quality education.

VSO's 'Valuing Teachers' research was originally piloted in three countries: Papua New Guinea, Zambia and Malawi; subsequently, a summary report entitled *What Makes Teachers Tick?* (Fry, 2002) was published. In developing countries, teachers' motivation is fragile and declining. Teachers are directly responsible for curriculum implementation, student discipline and classroom atmosphere. Because the role of teachers as deliverers of education is essential, motivation is central to the drive for quality education.

The 'Valuing Teachers' research and its follow-up in other countries provide a voice for teachers in policy discussions. It complements other research by focusing on, though not limiting itself to, the perceptions of teachers and how they can serve as a link between policy and effective work at classroom level.

'Addressing the factors that reduce teachers' motivation should be a major concern of policy-makers. This will create conditions for the success of other education interventions.' (Fry, 2002, p2)

Project rationale: in Rwanda

The research in Rwanda builds on what has been done in other countries. Its main purpose is to identify and analyse teachers' motivation in the country. However, it must be adapted to the specific context. This is why stakeholders within Rwanda's education system were consulted to provide input into the research process. For example, high-level stakeholders were consulted about the development of the research tools and contributed to the identification of particular questions to ask or areas to focus on. 'Valuing Teachers' is a timely initiative in this country, particularly since MINEDUC are in the process of producing a policy on teacher management and development in 2004.

'Different forms of teacher motivation shall be put in place.' (MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, p19)

VSO has been active in education in Rwanda since 1998. MINEDUC, as the primary partner organisation for VSO Rwanda, invited volunteers to support the post-genocide rebuilding of the education system, especially through classroom teaching. At the time of writing, 36 volunteers are teaching in secondary schools throughout the country and at six teacher training colleges (TTCs). In addition, seven non-classroom education placements are addressing issues around management and capacity-building in the wider education system. This includes four education advisers working with provincial or denominational education offices (VSO, 2003).

Given VSO's unique way of working through experienced volunteers, it is well placed to undertake research such as 'Valuing Teachers'. For instance, VSO is not a donor organisation, and it is one of the few non-faith-based international agencies working in the secondary education system (VSO, 2003). Our ongoing involvement at school level means that this research has been undertaken with a solid background knowledge of the realities in schools. The results from 'Valuing Teachers' will therefore be useful not only to volunteers and to the organisation, but also to a wider stakeholder audience working in education in Rwanda.

'Policy analysis and dialogue will benefit greatly from insights on teaching gained from teachers themselves.' (Fry, 2002, p5)

Research methodology in Rwanda

As mentioned above, the purpose of the 'Valuing Teachers' research in Rwanda was to identify and analyse the factors that influence teachers in their profession, with specific reference to motivation and performance. The main questions of the research were the following:

1. How do teachers feel generally about their work? What is the level of professional motivation?
2. What makes teachers happy? What makes teaching easier?
3. What makes teachers unhappy? What makes teaching more difficult?
4. What can be done? What can be improved?

These questions were addressed through a participatory research process², which included a variety of contacts with a wide range of stakeholders:

Ten initial meetings with key stakeholders allowed the researcher to inform high-level stakeholders about this research initiative and to solicit their support and their input into the research tools.

Ten focus group discussions (FGDs) were held in five provinces: Byumba, Gikongoro, Gitarama, Kibungo and Kigali. The FGD methodology (see Appendix 1) included three main activities as well as open discussion and recommendations. The participants were primary and secondary school teachers or future primary and secondary school teachers. A total of 95 teachers and teacher trainees participated in the FGDs.

Several semi-structured interviews with teachers, administrators and MINEDUC officials provided more in-depth information from these stakeholders.

One hundred and twenty respondents completed a survey, which allowed for some quantified data to complement the qualitative analysis of this research. The respondents included VSO secondary school teachers, national primary and secondary school teachers, and teacher trainees (TTC level and post-secondary school level). The survey questions varied according to each respondent's situation (see Appendix 2).

A stakeholders' meeting was held on 18 November 2003 to provide a forum for dialogue among a wider range of stakeholders. MINEDUC directors or members of their departments attended alongside representatives from schools, denominational organisations, NGOs, PTAs, teachers training institutions and unions. The data collected at this meeting provided a point of comparison with teachers' views and reinforced the findings from the FGDs (see Appendix 3 for participants' list and programme).

Desk-based research completed the field research by providing background information on the wider education policy context, as well as an opportunity for cross-referencing with findings from the field research.

²The research process is outlined in a VSO toolkit called *START — Simple Toolkit for Advocacy Research Techniques*.

Gender disaggregated data was analysed from two main sources: Activity 3 of the FGD (identifying and ranking demotivating factors) and the survey. Where applicable, the differences experienced by men and women teachers will be identified in this report.

Although primary school teachers, secondary school teachers and teacher trainees identified similar themes, analysis of the survey and the FGD findings show some differences in perceptions. These will be highlighted in the report, where relevant.

Research participants' feedback about their involvement in 'Valuing Teachers' was primarily positive. Although some participants expressed concern about the potential for change as a result of this research, most were thankful for the opportunity to express their views. One participant asserted:

'Participation in this FGD has given us the opportunity to reflect in a new way and to think about improvements we might like to see.'

Another interviewee expressed thanks:

'I appreciate your visit because we are relieved. Even though we have problems, small salaries, there is someone who is thinking of us, and who makes a journey to come and listen to us. We hope that these are not things that will be stored somewhere, but that will be valued – as the research says. We hope that this will be honoured.' (Female primary school headteacher)

The methodology is primarily qualitative and participatory. Qualitative research ensures the subjective perceptions of participants are represented accurately and truthfully. The participatory nature of 'Valuing Teachers' encouraged input from all stakeholders, with specific reference to teachers.

The qualitative analysis of the findings took place in a multi-step process that aimed to categorise factors and link them to possible solutions. This process allows for abstraction and simplification of a wide variety of factors, while still respecting the perceptions of teachers. The voices of participants are represented in this report, both through direct quotes and through generalisations made during the analysis process.

The findings are grouped into six main themes, each of which is outlined in a separate chapter in this report:

1. Terms and conditions
2. Supporting enhanced performance
3. School-level management
4. Community integration and social standing
5. Strengthening the system
6. Communication and accountability.

This report, therefore, represents the views of teachers primarily in terms of their experiences and their recommendations. It does not aim to analyse the education sector as a whole, but rather to communicate the factors most relevant to teacher motivation in order to suggest priority areas where decision-makers could make a difference to the lives of teachers, and therefore to the quality of education.

Contextual information

'The development of human resources is one of the principal factors in achieving sustainable economic and social development. Education and training has been considered as a critical lynchpin to achieve development and poverty reduction.'

(MINEDUC, 2003b, EFA Plan of Action, p37)

Policy documentation

Policy documentation in Rwanda begins by outlining the tremendous steps already taken in rebuilding the country over the last decade. In education, for example, strengths include:

- the political will and commitment of the nation to reconstruct the education system after the war and genocide of 1994

- the existence of policy guiding documentation
- the existence of administrative and educational structures
- the rehabilitation of many schools that has already taken place
- eleven functioning TTCs and a distance training scheme, as well as in-service training opportunities through the Kigali Institute of Education (KIE) and Centres de Formation des Jeunes (CFJs; youth training centres). (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p8)

Vision 2020 (MINEDUC, 2003d), the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (2003), the decentralisation policy and the information and communications technology (ICT) policy provide a framework that guides policy in the education sector. The Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) is a tool for managing the financial aspect of policy strategies and outputs. Rwanda aims to achieve international development targets such as Universal Primary Education (UPE) and EFA. The EFA Plan of Action (MINEDUC 2003b) puts into effect the six Dakar goals (Dakar Framework of Action: *Education for All*, 2000) as well as a seventh goal surrounding HIV and AIDS, which involves:

- expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children
- ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls, children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to and complete free and compulsory primary education of good quality
- ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life-skills programmes
- achieving a 50% improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women, and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults
- eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality
- improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognised and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life.
- preventing the propagation and limiting the expansion of HIV and AIDS infection within and outside the school environment.

The mission, goals and objectives for the education sector in Rwanda emerge from this policy context. They include the following objectives:

- to ensure that education is available and accessible to all Rwandese people
- to improve the quality and relevance of education
- to promote the teaching of science and technology with a special focus on ICT
- to promote trilingualism in the country
- to promote an integral, comprehensive education orientated towards the respect of human rights and adapted to the present situation of the country
- to inculcate in children, and sensitise them to, the importance of environment, hygiene, and health and protection against HIV and AIDS
- to improve the capacity for planning, management and administration of education
- to promote research as a mobilising factor for national development and harmonise the research agenda. (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p9)

The main policy-related documents used in this research include the ESP (MINEDUC, 2003a), which outlines the policy itself. The ESSP (MINEDUC 2003c) is a tool for policy implementation, which indicates activities, costs and timelines involved in putting policy into practice. The NCDC/MINEDUC textbook policy (McCall, 2003), and the Primary and Secondary School Curriculum Development policy (MINEDUC, 2003e) and 6 year plan: 2004–2009 (MINEDUC, 2003f) outline future changes to curriculum and its implementation in Rwanda. The 2003 World Bank/Government of Rwanda report entitled *Education in Rwanda: Rebalancing Resources to Accelerate Post-Conflict Development and Poverty Reduction* provided background information surrounding policy and practice.

The 'Valuing Teachers' research initiative is timely in Rwanda given that the quest for quality in education has come to the fore. The place of teacher management and development in improving the quality teaching is clear: stakeholders agree there is a strong link between motivation and performance. Presently, a task force on teacher management and development is working towards producing a specific policy in this area. This

research therefore feeds directly into the process by highlighting the priorities teachers have identified. The teachers' perceptions have been compared with existing policy and implementation plans with an aim to make constructive, appropriate recommendations about how teachers' needs can best be met.

The education system

The education system in Rwanda includes 35,027 teachers working at 2,535 schools³ with 1,616,735 students⁴. There are three main types of school:

1. public schools, which are entirely funded by the government
2. subsidised schools, where teachers' salaries are covered by the government, but where other funding comes through religious organisations or other groups such as NGOs
3. private schools, which are funded by parents' associations or school fees.

The average pupil–teacher ratio is 57.3⁵ pupils per teacher at primary school level and around 22⁶ at secondary school level. The practice of shifting is used at lower primary level (P1–P3) by over 90%⁷ of classes attending in shifts. Shifting involves lower primary pupils (P1–P3) being divided into two groups, each group spending half a day at school. Students may attend pre-primary education, but this is relatively rare.

'The net enrolment rate has been steadily increasing and is currently 78.3% (2003–2003) for both girls and boys. However, the rates of drop-out and repetition are high, at 16.6% and 17.2% respectively.' (MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, p9)

Primary education continues for six years, terminating with a national examination at the end of P6. Seven per cent of secondary-age students⁸ attend secondary school, which is divided into lower secondary (S1–S3) and upper secondary (S4–S6).

At upper secondary level, students are divided into sections, where they take courses in an area of specialisation such as languages, maths/physics or primary teacher training. Their enrolment in one section or another depends on their success in a national exam at S3 level. A final national exam at the end of S6 determines their success in obtaining a secondary school diploma. Post-secondary education, available to approximately 1% of the population, is available in six public institutions and four private institutions⁹.

Teacher training in Rwanda takes place at upper secondary and post-secondary level. By these criteria, 85.2% of primary school teachers are considered qualified¹⁰, whereas 52.1% of secondary school teachers are qualified¹¹. Future primary school teachers train at one of the country's 11 TTCs. Future secondary school teachers are enrolled in the education departments of the National University of Rwanda (NUR) and the KIE. It is worth noting that the first graduating class from KIE will finish their studies and enter the workforce within the next year. This will add a new dimension of qualification to the secondary school system in the country.

³ Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning, 2002, Tables 14.1 and 14.2

⁴ WBGR, 2003, p35

⁵ For all schools, including private (where the ratio is 33.3); WBGR, 2003, p77

⁶ WBGR, 2003, p106

⁷ WBGR, 2003, p77

⁸ MINEDUC, 2003c ESSP, p21

⁹ WBGR, 2003, p125

¹⁰ MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, p10

¹¹ MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, p11

Teacher motivation in Rwanda

'Teaching is good and rewarding but the atmosphere that we Rwandans are working in is discouraging. And, if the education sector makes no headway, then the whole future of our country is at stake.' (Female primary school teacher)

Although working with students can be rewarding, teachers find their work difficult. Their motivation levels are strongly affected by financial difficulties, not being supported to perform well, management issues and a perception that they are not integrated in society. A host of factors in these areas create the 'discouraging' atmosphere this teacher identifies.

'As a teacher, I feel lower class, neglected and poorly paid. This is the reason that I don't like my work.' (Male secondary school teacher)

FGD teacher participants identified positive and negative aspects of their daily routines and then rated their general satisfaction about their working day. On average, their level of satisfaction was 58%. On the positive side, they enjoy giving lessons, being with students and having routines. Discouraging factors included difficulty getting to school, interruptions or negative interactions at school (surrounding student discipline, or meetings with the headteacher, for example) and not having enough time to rest or enough food to eat. Their response shows that despite some positive aspects, there is still a long way to go in promoting teacher motivation.

'A happier teacher is motivated. With motivation every job is done very well.'
(Male future secondary school teacher)

Interviewees agree that male and female teachers experience these difficulties in different ways, mainly because of their distinct family roles. Generally, female teachers reported more positive feelings about teaching. Nearly half of female teachers who responded to the survey stated 'wanting to teach' or 'admiring the profession' as one of the reasons for taking up teaching. Most male teachers gave practical reasons for entering the profession, such as 'needing employment'. In fact, in terms of teacher retention, most women expect to remain in teaching, whereas more men hope to move on to find higher paying jobs, to increase their qualifications or to pursue other interests.

Primary and secondary school teachers' responses also showed some dissimilarities. Primary school teachers mentioned students, training and educating others as the main reasons for their positive feelings in teaching, whereas secondary school teachers' positive feelings were influenced by their opportunities for continuous learning, what they were doing for their country and their students. Sixty-six per cent of primary school teachers who responded to the survey question stated that they expected to stay in teaching, whereas 60% of secondary school teachers hoped to leave the profession. Teachers' reasons for remaining in the job included enjoying teaching, staying in spite of difficulties, and having no other options. It is worth noting that no secondary school teacher quoted 'liking teaching' as a reason to stay. Both primary and secondary school teachers indicated the following main factors as contributing to their dissatisfaction:

- low salary
- working conditions
- lack of resources and school facilities
- feeling undervalued.

Whether it is a long walk to school, lesson preparations without books, delays in salary administration, or lack of support from parents, the challenges teachers face in Rwanda affect their classroom work. As one focus group outlined, a teacher who has 'worries' will be absent more often, and when present will be distracted and might not concentrate fully on the objectives of the lesson. Collectively, focus group participants identified 92 characteristics of a motivated, satisfied teacher. These included being active, competent, confident, cooperative, courageous, exemplary, finishing what they had begun, meeting objectives, being patient, planning well, professional integrity, being respected, and being successful.

The link between teachers' motivation and performance is clear and is taken for granted by most stakeholders in education in Rwanda. In response to the question: 'Does a happier teacher teach better?' the stakeholders' meeting participants echoed the resounding 'Yes!' of the FGD groups. One FGD participant remarked:

'The reasons are clear. It goes without saying.'

Others provided some explanation, such as:

'Umuntu atanga icyo afite, iyo atanga yishiruye atanga wese, akanitanga.' [A person gives only what he has; so when he gives in a state of happiness, he gives himself fully.] (Female primary school teacher)

During the analysis stage of this research process, the factors affecting motivation were grouped into six main categories and organised into an 'input-output' model (Appendix 4). This model shows that teachers' motivation is directly influenced by: terms and conditions, strengthening the system, school-level management, supporting enhanced performance, communication and accountability and community integration. For example, non-salary benefits such as loans of bikes, good accommodation and bonuses help to motivate teachers. A strong curriculum with textbooks that teachers can work with easily will also create incentives. Similarly, when school administrators or parents recognise teachers' efforts, their motivation level rises. This report will examine each of these relationships and their policy implications in the chapters that follow.

In turn, teachers' motivation affects school-level management, teachers' ability to perform well and the prospects for successful community integration. In concrete terms, motivated staff make an administrator's job easier. Teachers can be resourceful in creating or sharing resources when they are motivated to do so. The home-school relationship improves when teachers are respected and feel part of the community. Finally, when these inputs and outputs occur in an atmosphere of transparent communication and accountability, teachers' trust in the system stimulates their performance.

'There are several areas in which quality can be improved: the qualification of teachers, the availability of books and other educational materials, the relevance of the curriculum, the standard of school premises, and the atmosphere of school itself.' (MINEDUC, 2003b, EFA Plan of Action, p34)

Chapter 1: Terms and conditions

'Teachers should be properly motivated through better housing, provision of reasonable salary, transport, medical care, well-equipped libraries for better performance.' (Male secondary school teacher)

Salary

Teachers emphasised the need for terms and conditions of teaching to be improved. Salary was cited as the most important factor. Several FGD participants said that if salaries were to increase, all other problems would be alleviated. As some recognised, non-salary terms and conditions must also be studied and improved. For instance, the government's current bicycle programme, where teachers can lease-to-own a bicycle, is one step in this direction.

"Teaching is equal to poverty," so the saying goes. So I hate the associated implications of teaching and sometimes hate myself as a teacher.'

(Male secondary school teacher)

All teachers expressed dissatisfaction about pay. Teachers earn less than they expect, given their level of education. For secondary school teachers, financial opportunity was the main reason cited for wanting to give up teaching. Future secondary school teachers also dreaded the low salary.

Teachers feel poor alongside others who are less educated, who earn more than they do.

'People "in the hills" – farmers, small businesspeople – are richer than teachers. They see the poor teacher who doesn't even have a bicycle, who only has one pair of shoes, who only has one pair of trousers.' (Primary school teacher)

An average primary school teacher's salary is 308,522 Rwandan francs (RwF) annually. A secondary school teacher earns 1.5 times that amount, or 462,783 RwF per year (WBGR, 2003). This represents 4.0 times the per capita GNP (1999 figures). Not surprisingly, primary school teachers communicated more desperate messages about salary. In particular, teachers who are heads of their household reported serious problems related to poverty, such as famine or not being able to repair their accommodation. One rural focus group explained how a teacher who is not well paid has to arrange a way to get food through:

- trips to the popular bank looking for loans
- going to the businesspeople or shopkeepers looking for loans
- working in the garden 5–7.30am, then after school looking around for something to eat.

'Gardening and cooking take time, and are tiring, so the teacher arrives at school already tired and is tired in front of students.' (Male secondary school teacher)

'[As a teacher] I feel humiliated, ashamed and even in despair. I don't enjoy my work any more because it doesn't allow me to solve problems at home – even to buy clothes for my wife. If conditions were improved, I could feel proud of my work. Here in Rwanda, the salary no longer has the buying power it once had, and things are getting worse to the extent that teachers become ridiculed.'

(Male secondary school teacher)

The cost of living in Rwanda has risen and continues to rise. Though teachers are not alone in experiencing inflation, people's perception of teachers' poverty has a direct impact on motivation. The chapter on community integration will address this issue more thoroughly.

'Teachers cannot cover their needs. ('Not even half!' one participant heckles.) He can't even buy two sacks of rice. And that presupposes that he eats only rice...'

(FGD group: primary school teachers)

The policy context in Rwanda acknowledges these issues surrounding teachers' low pay. Raising teachers' salaries also means reorganising or raising the recurrent budget in education. As the Education Sector Strategic Plan explicitly states, one of the main challenges in education is:

'increasing the recurrent budget for education of which the majority is absorbed by salaries, and managing changing donor support as Rwanda moves out of emergency into development.' (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p7)

The recent Government of Rwanda/World Bank report on education in Rwanda argues in favour of increasing recurrent spending, while outlining the challenges in achieving this. For instance, teachers' salaries could be raised if the food allocation grant was diminished (WBGR, 2003, p44). Increased funding to education must be considered seriously because this is the most important factor cited by teachers as affecting their motivation. Stakeholders in education – from teachers themselves to government officials – can advocate for revising external conditionalities that limit recurrent spending.

'Our acquired rights are lacking – that means our backpay and salary increases.'
(FGD group)

Salary issues extend to the administration of salary and benefits. The decentralisation process means that the current system of paying teachers is in transition. Some teachers identified decentralised processes as being more convenient than the previous national system, although more research participants identified challenges related to the administration of pay. Perhaps in response to the government's World Teachers' Day pledge to deliver unpaid salaries¹², one FGD interviewee noted:

'Backpay: this is being talked about but it is not being given.'

There is clearly a need at provincial level for increased capacity in administering pay. This will allow teachers to receive backpay and régularisation, which means increases of salary according to experience/seniority. With increased budget support, this can be achieved. Again, advocacy at national/donor level to increase recurrent spending in education will play a role in ensuring that teachers receive what they term their 'acquired rights'.

In recent years, Rwandan schools have begun collecting PTA dues from parents. In practice, this has become a 'bonus' system for teachers. In fact, this bonus is sometimes called 'la motivation' in French. The guidelines surrounding the PTA dues need to be made clearer and more equitable, because teachers are already talking of being attracted to schools with a higher bonus. An inequitable distribution of bonuses would contribute negatively to equality of access, especially in poor or isolated areas. Thus, there is a need to examine and implement a subsidised bonus system to cover the PTA dues where parents are unable to pay.

'If salaries cannot be increased, they [teachers] should be motivated in other possible ways so as to improve their life standard, such as facilities in building houses, getting loans...' (Male future secondary school teacher)

Non-salary incentives

Some teachers, recognising the limited resources available, identified other non-salary incentives that could help to motivate them. Based on an analysis of FGD results, which considered the frequency and relative importance that participants gave to certain responses, the following incentives were identified (in order of importance):

- Accommodation subsidies and/or loans (analysis score: 41)
- Transport (analysis score: 35)
- Health care (analysis score: 30)
- Training opportunities (analysis score: 24).

Accommodation

Quality accommodation, including loans to obtain it, was therefore teachers' top priority in terms of non-salary incentives. Some teachers suggested that they could rent-to-own housing built by government or schools:

'I recognise that this is costly, but it could be possible to extend credits to schools. Schools would build houses, and teachers pay a minimum rent to cover the school's debt. Little by little, the house will be paid off.' (Male secondary school discipline master/teacher)

Transport

Transport, teachers' second general priority, is currently being addressed by MINEDUC. The bicycles have now arrived. Teachers appreciate this project and hope to see such initiatives continue. Responding to teachers' suggestions of providing loans for motorcycles, for example, could build on this initial success.

Health care

There exists a health care insurance system for teachers called RAMA (Rwandaise d'assurance maladie). While some teachers raised positive points about this system, many more showed scepticism or a lack of trust in it:

'A teacher thinks that he is insured, but when an accident happens, he is not accompanied. He does not get the money.' (Future primary school teacher)

RAMA coverage could therefore be strengthened, while unions and decentralised authorities could play a role in communicating this to teachers. Additionally, access to health care is being increased in some communities through non-RAMA health associations (*mutuelles*). This needs to be explored further so that teachers can trust in their coverage. Finally, there are RAMA pharmacies at least in each province's main town. Increasing the number and the distribution of RAMA pharmacies will allow teachers to have access to health care so that they will have more faith in the system.

Training

Teachers also identified the need for training opportunities, which can be considered a non-salary incentive as well as a way of supporting improved performance. For example, the 21%¹³ underqualified primary school teachers in the system would very much like to upgrade their qualifications to a full secondary diploma. They are, in fact, concerned for their jobs. However, it is not easy for them to undertake distance learning.

Previous teacher training institutions, called Normale inférieure or Normale moyenne, led to three- to five-year diplomas (D3 to D5), rather than the current Normale primaire (TTC), which leads to the now required six-year diploma (D6). D5 diploma holders are considered 'underqualified', and many hope to upgrade their qualifications to the D6 level.

'I wanted to upgrade my qualifications to D6, but with my situation, it's not possible. We don't have electricity at home. I would need to study in the area where I work, then go back home to the neighbouring village in the dark – and me a woman!' (Female primary school teacher)

In general, teachers need options and opportunities for further training. This could be made possible through increased distance-learning opportunities, for example. Teachers also identified a need for university-level training opportunities – an area that requires study and implementation according to the needs of teachers.

Fees for teachers' children

A fifth non-salary incentive that emerged from teachers' recommendations involved lowering school fees for teachers' children. Primary school teachers have particular difficulty affording the 21,500 RwF¹⁴ per year to send a child to secondary school. There is a risk that Rwanda could enter a negative education cycle, where parents cannot afford to educate their children to their own level of education.

¹² 'Teachers to get backpay', *The New Times*, 30 October–2 November 1993, p3

'Wouldn't it be possible to give the chance for teachers' children to go to secondary school? A teacher with three to four children cannot pay secondary school fees for all of them. To give these children a chance, the state could pay for two children out of four if it's possible. So this would be a subsidy.' (Primary school teacher)

Policy on incentives

The Rwandan policy environment does not overlook these non-salary incentives. One of the main challenges of education identified in the ESSP is: 'improving the status of the teacher and providing incentives for the job given salary and conditions of service which do not motivate'. Moreover, teachers' priorities correspond with most of the relevant strategies identified in the ESSP, which are to:

'Provide incentives to attract new people to the teaching profession and to retain those already there: facilitate teachers to have access to bank credits and savings credit unions; additional incentives (ie INSET, accommodation); sensitise communities to get involved in financing education by 2004.' (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p26)

With a strong teacher training and management policy, to be developed in 2004 (MINEDUC, 2003f, NCDC 6 year plan: 2004–2009, p3), more emphasis can be placed on incentives for teachers. The main policy document states that '...different forms of teacher motivation shall be put in place' (p19), and one of the aims of this report is to communicate which activities would best motivate teachers. In compliance with the ESSP, a savings and loans scheme for teachers should be established. The primary school teachers' union is already collaborating with the government to ensure that this priority identified by teachers is put into action¹⁵.

To respond more effectively to the needs identified by teachers, incentives should be made more explicit in policy documentation. An incentives system would additionally play a role in diminishing disparities in education because it could attract teachers to poor and/or isolated areas. Both salary and non-salary incentives should be included in the teacher management and development policy as a response to the biggest challenge teachers face in Rwanda today.

In conclusion, although the EFA Plan of Action (MINEDUC, 2003b, p34) underlines the importance of qualifications in terms of the quality of education, policy could be more explicit about how to motivate teachers. In particular, teachers identified salary, housing, transport, health care (coverage and access) and cash entitlements (such as bonuses, backpay and régularisation) as their primary needs in the area of terms and conditions. These priorities need to be considered in policy and implementation of change. A strengthened union could work effectively with MINEDUC on non-salary incentives. All need to work towards increasing spending in the area of terms and conditions.

¹³ Calculated from MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, p10

¹⁴ Secondary school fees are 21,500 RwF/yr (MINEDUC, 2003b, *EFA Plan of Action*, p28). Note that this includes tuition and boarding only, not uniform fees, the cost of materials or the PTA dues, which can add up to another 10,000 RwF.

¹⁵ Kayiranga Narcisse, President of SNEP, interview, 23 September 2003

Chapter 2: Supporting enhanced performance

'With the drive of the EFA movement, it is now more essential than ever that teachers are supported and enabled to engage positively with the process of education reform, and to perform well in the classroom. If they are not supported in this way, education quality will undoubtedly suffer. Teachers, of all people, do not want this to happen.' (Fry, 2002, p5)

A key aspect of making teachers valued is ensuring they are supported to do a good job. Generally, teachers claim the most positive thing about their work is being in the classroom with students, giving lessons, sharing knowledge, playing a role in educating the future generation. Nevertheless, they face a variety of challenges in being able to do a good job. The following factors, if improved, would help them to feel more motivated and allow them to improve the quality of education at classroom level:

- teaching and learning materials (TLMs)
- training
- school infrastructure (including sanitation, water and electricity)
- class size
- personal life factors (welfare and status in the community).

Teaching and learning materials

'We don't have chalk, attendance books (we trace them ourselves in workbooks), teaching aids, class diary...' (Female primary school teacher)

The provision of TLMs needs to be increased. At school level, these include chalk and teaching aids such as wallcharts or globes. There needs to be, therefore, prioritisation in the school budget for teaching aids and classroom materials. To avoid overspending and loss of materials, schools need to establish storage and sharing systems. These will be provided through management training for headteachers. At national level, the government plans to play a role in TLM provision. For instance, the ESSP aims to 'provide support materials for all schools, especially technical, professional and specialist schools' by 2008, starting in 2005 (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p26).

Teachers identified the lack of textbooks as a major obstacle to performance. Textbook provision is the responsibility of NCDC. The policy plans¹⁶ outline the way in which appropriate textbooks will be developed and provided. These textbooks, which need to reflect the new (to be developed) curricula, are starting to become available. Schools have already received French and English textbooks at primary level. Others will become available in forthcoming years. Thus, the NCDC policy implementation needs to be carried out effectively to ensure all materials are available as soon as possible and the textbooks provided do actually meet the needs of students.

'Recently, we received English textbooks that were not adapted to the school curriculum. For instance the 'kilometric' tests for P6 [sixth grade, primary school] are too difficult for students. These look like Ugandan textbooks [for Anglophones], with a new cover.' (Primary school teacher)

¹⁶ For instance, TLM provision and curriculum reform are priority areas (phase I, first five years) in the EFA Plan (primary level p14; secondary p21). Additionally, the ESSP aims to 'provide TTCs with learning/teaching equipment and materials, appropriate for primary classroom training' (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p15).

Training

Pre-service teacher training does not always include training on how to use TLMs, such as adapting textbooks to the students' level. Teachers' responses and recommendations clearly showed that provision of TLMs also implies training in how to use them. At national level, this training needs to be prioritised to coincide with provision of TLMs. Also, national coordination of training ensures equity throughout the country. Training could take place at provincial level to allow teachers greater access – this would entail increasing provincial capacity for funding, organising and running training sessions.

'I don't really like my work because I did not train for it.' (Male secondary school teacher)

Most noticeable at secondary school level, where the majority of teachers have academic but not professional qualifications, teachers' lack of training in pedagogy, methodology and classroom administration contributes to demotivation. Pre-service training needs to be relevant, comprehensive and valued. It should focus on practical skills over theoretical knowledge in education. Also, in-service training should supplement the academic background of practising teachers.

In this regard, the ESSP aims to:

- provide upgrading to full qualification for partially qualified teachers in service (p15)
- give all teachers two weeks' INSET per year (p16)
- increase number of qualified teachers 5% per year (secondary level) (p25) through INSET, distance education.

It is important to note that implementation of these strategies will be effective if teacher training capacity at provincial and local levels is increased, both through budgeting and human resources. This is an essential ingredient in the broader decentralisation process.

TTCs and post-secondary school teacher training institutions need to attract able students who are interested in teaching. In fact, the training of more teachers will be necessary for achieving UPE by 2010 (MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, p10). Unfortunately, however, teacher training has often been considered a 'last resort':

'The teaching activity isn't considered as a job. Many people do it by missing what else they can do.' (Male future secondary school teacher)

To counteract this stereotype, a strong commitment from NCDC and other Ministry institutions is imperative. Moreover, the teachers' status in the community needs to change so that more able and engaged students strive to enter the profession. Rwanda would then be able to meet the priority of 'increased teacher training at better TTCs'¹⁷ by 2008 (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p14). The same document outlines the main steps involved in achieving this priority. Teachers' voices, therefore, highlight the importance of committing to these changes and to effective implementation of policy.

School infrastructure

Infrastructure includes school buildings in good repair, facilities such as libraries, laboratories and sports fields, as well as adequate sanitation, electricity and water. Teachers' views once again reflect policy statements surrounding the need for solid infrastructure, not only for providing increased access¹⁸, but also quality in education.

At school level, this must remain a top priority. Headteachers, who would benefit from planned training in this area, need to budget for improvements in infrastructure. Furthermore, they need to solicit community involvement in building and repairing schools. In fact, this is an area where a wide variety of stakeholders contribute towards increased collaboration in education in order to: 'increase infrastructure and civil society and faith-based organisations' initiatives in construction and management of schools and equipment in accordance with set standards' (MINEDUC, 2003f, NCDC 6 year plan: 2004–2009, p18). Nevertheless, to ensure equity throughout the system, solid infrastructure must be guaranteed by authorities so that areas where parents or communities are unable to pay are subsidised.

¹⁷ This is linked to the post-secondary priority of revising pre-service and in-service training for secondary level (at KIE, NUR) by 2009 (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p26).

¹⁸ Policy (p10) states that construction and rehabilitation of classes are important in achieving UPE by 2010, for instance through building 4,466 primary classrooms in five years (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p15); building more secondary classrooms (ongoing) (p22); and equipping 66 science laboratories (3x22 schools) by 2008 (p25).

Class size

'To have good student results, it is necessary to reduce class size. When classrooms are cramped and in poor repair, students learn nothing.'

(Primary school teacher)

When students learn more readily, the teacher's job is made easier. As the above citation illustrates, the teaching-learning process is facilitated by manageable class size and good infrastructure. One FGD took place at a very rural primary school where 493 students attend school in seven mud-walled classrooms. This means an average class size of approximately 70 students, which is higher than the national average of 57.3 pupils per teacher at primary level. Shifting is practiced there, as in over 90% of classes at lower primary level nationwide. The main consequences of shifting are a higher workload for the teacher, owing to the large class size, as well as reduced class time for the students.

During the research, teachers made some suggestions about the use of shifting. For example, two teachers could share the responsibilities of teaching shifts – one for each shift. This would free teachers up for studies in the evening. All agree that less shifting means less work for teachers at that level, more learning time for students, greater student success, and therefore higher quality of education and levels of motivation for teachers.

'[What I find difficult] is teaching many students whom I can't help enough during the lesson by repeating new words or by correcting their written exercises.'

(Female primary school teacher)

Whether through reducing shifting or generally decreasing class size, more teachers will be needed to meet the learning needs of the increasing numbers of pupils attending school. As outlined above, more training is required, implying the need for increased capacity and coordination of MINEDUC institutions responsible for training¹⁹. This will allow the government to meet its goal to raise the number of fully trained public sector (primary school²⁰) teachers from 28,834 in 2004 to 32,403 in 2008 (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p15).

Personal life factors

Two factors of personal relevance – welfare and status in the community – are linked to being enabled to perform well (alongside other factors). In terms of teachers' welfare, better living conditions would allow them to concentrate more on work and less on problems with their accommodation, food needs and family financing.

'A happy teacher is punctual. He/she leaves home with transport. At this school, for instance, we come from 50 minutes' walk away. We can't go home at lunch. We don't eat at lunchtime. Even if we could find a restaurant, it's a bit far from here, and we have difficulty finding the money. There are no restaurants in the village.'

(Primary school teacher)

As discussed in the previous chapter, better pay as well as non-salary incentives, would go a long way to ensure that teachers are able to do their job well. Teachers' status in the community, to be addressed in the Chapter 4: Community integration and social status, plays a major role in teachers' motivation. When community relations are positive, student discipline, respect and learning improve. Teachers gain confidence through respect and status accorded by the community. These personal areas, although discussed in more detail in other chapters, do support enhanced performance

'To change careers is not my first intention. If the teachers could be given their true value, then they could work wonders. Sometimes, certain obstacles impede this career.' (Female secondary school teachers)

¹⁹ An extensive training study has been carried out with Canadian consulting company TECSULT: *Renforcement du Système Educatif Rwandais* (July 2003). Now there is a need to use its findings to implement comprehensive training schemes.

²⁰ And to increase by 1,900 the number of new secondary school teachers by 2008 (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p22)

Chapter 3: School-level management

'The relationship with administrators is very important. Good relationship means teachers who work efficiently.' (Secondary school teacher)

Teacher–administration relationships

The headteacher plays a crucial role in teachers' motivation. All aspects of day-to-day teaching are influenced by the headteacher's management style, because they set the tone for the school. Student discipline, administration, professional relationships and community integration are all strongly reliant on the headteachers' communication and decisions. At secondary school level, headteachers work with deans of studies and discipline masters to form an administration team. School-level management is therefore the responsibility of these administrators.

'The atmosphere of school must be friendly and welcoming to children. The school ethos is largely a matter of the attitude of the headteacher and the teachers.'

(MINEDUC, 2003b, EFA Plan of Action)

Overall communication and trust must be established through building a positive relationship between teachers and school-level management. Strong management would avoid the constraint in retention related to poor school administration through absenteeism. Teachers will have positive perceptions of headteachers through their addressing other specific factors at school level, such as the sharing and storing of TLMs, clarifying roles and responsibilities within the school, and financial transparency.

Promotion and training

First of all, a strong promotional system will allow for the recruitment of the most appropriate and able managers. Additionally, headteacher training will encourage better management overall. This training clearly needs to be a government priority, where coordination and implementation take place effectively²¹.

Accountability and transparency

'I have an excellent working relationship with the school administration, even though promises are not always kept.' (VSO male secondary school teacher)

As this citation shows, an essential aspect of headteacher training surrounds the topic of accountability and transparency. Given the remuneration issues that teachers raised, there is understandable concern about the bonus. Teachers are often unsure or mistrustful about how the PTA dues are spent at school level. Financial transparency and accountability are essential for building positive relationships among teachers and headteachers.

Appreciation

'[What makes me unhappy as a teacher is] if my services are not appreciated by the school administration despite the hard work I put in.' (Male secondary school teacher)

Moreover, a nurturing management style goes a long way with teachers in helping them to feel valued. If their work is appreciated at school level, this is passed on to the community and it enables better community relations and status in the community. Again, a strong promotional system, as well as in-service training, will mean headteachers acquire better management skills, including developing a nurturing style and promoting positive communication in the workplace.

²⁰ MINEDUC and NGOs both play a role in designing and implementing management training for headteachers. For instance, VVOB, the Flemish association for development cooperation and technical assistance, has begun a cascade-style training, which has a five-year plan. Twelve model/pilot schools have been identified, and trained headteachers will in turn train three of their headteacher 'neighbours' within two years. In this way, all headteachers nationally should have had contact with the training material within five years. (Gary Stewart, personal communication)

Consultation and communication

An essential ingredient in school management involves consultation and decision-making with teachers. In addition to promoting management skills at school level, the wider education system needs to have a place for the teachers' voice. As the secondary school teachers explain below, when teachers are consulted they feel involved in decisions and they feel valued:

'If teachers are given the chance to make decisions, then relationships with administration are better. If decisions are made on paper only, then teachers feel small about it. Left out of the decision-making process once, then a teacher will remain silent the next time. For instance, the headteacher may come to school with decisions already made about students' performance, behaviour and discipline...' (FGD secondary school teachers)

As a critical link among teachers, local authorities and community members, headteachers are responsible for communicating education changes at school level. To enable this, better communication systems (such as meetings, noticeboards etc) are required. These skills need to be included in headteacher training. Furthermore, a strengthened inspectorate will ensure better communication from national to local levels.

Policy on school-level management

These needs are recognised in policy documentation. For instance, the government plans to:

- 'teach school management and administration to all teachers, and ensure that school heads regularly undergo special training' (MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, p20)
- 'train new heads of department and advisers/monitors for all schools' (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p27)
- 'develop a guide on the management of financial, human and material resources for secondary school administrations'; creation and publication of the guide is due to start in 2005 (ESSP, p27)
- 'train school administrators in the management of financial, material and human resources' (ESSP, p27)
- 'establish accounting procedures for secondary education managers to account for the academic and financial management of their schools' (in 2004, ongoing) (ESSP, p28).

Effective implementation of these plans with high-quality training will represent a response to needs identified by teachers to:

- build a positive perception of headteachers
- ensure accountability of headteachers (ie, attendance, financial transparency)
- develop management skills of headteachers, including a nurturing management approach, effective communication (including negotiating language differences) and consultation of teachers
- ensure teachers are consulted in change processes
- establish communication lines so that changes in education are brought to school level
- improve the sharing and storing of TLMs.

Chapter 4: Community integration and social status

Negative attitudes towards teachers

'Rwandan society ignores teachers; if you do a survey you will find the truth.'

(Female primary school teacher)

Teachers do not feel integrated and valued in their communities. This is largely because of the perception that they, as educated people, are poorer than they ought to be. Community integration is important for teachers to feel supported and appreciated in their role as educators – not only as bringers of knowledge, but also as role models for children.

To value the nurturing role of teachers, relationships with the community must be enabled through positive discourse around teachers. Teachers would like to counteract common stereotypes of themselves as 'shabby drunkards'. This can be done in part by teachers themselves, but they do need the support from other stakeholders in education to promote more positive messages about teachers. A key element of better community integration is improved parent–teacher communication: this can be promoted through headteachers and PTAs.

Acknowledging teachers as nurturing role models

'In schools we have some students who have lost their parents to HIV and AIDS. These students lack parental love and care and this affects their learning. As a teacher, this makes my work difficult if I must put these students on the level with others.' (Male secondary school teacher)

The expectations on teachers extend far beyond transmitting knowledge in the classroom. In addition to coping with their own financial or familial pressures, they serve as role models for children, enabling them to develop values and life skills (MINEDUC, 2003e, NCDC Primary and Secondary School Curriculum Development Policy, p4). Particularly in the case of orphans and/or boarders, teachers play a parental role in the lives of their students. Often one of the few educated adults in a child's life, the teacher plays a crucial part in their development, through behaviour and advice. The teachers' relationship to society has great relevance to their ability to meet these expectations:

'Policy-makers rightly believe that the work of teachers should incorporate an element of nurturing and socialisation, with teachers active as role models and counsellors for their pupils... This means that teachers' work ethic, gender roles, professionalism and relationship with community and society at large have an enormous impact on pupils.' (Fry, 2002, p11)

The nurturing role of teachers must be acknowledged and valued. School-level management plays a key role in communicating this value, both to teachers and to the community. The PTA also plays its part as this is the link between home and school. The need for strengthening PTAs, both at grassroots level and in the policy environment, is great.

'[A] daunting task is that of educating and nurturing large numbers of traumatised children who have lost the most significant adults in their lives. The challenge will undoubtedly require front-line workers, in this case, teachers and school administrators, to go far beyond the ordinary duties of classroom teaching to address the psychological needs of their charges as well.' (WBGR, 2003, p5)

As this quote demonstrates, the wider role of teachers is acknowledged to some extent in the education system. At policy level, plans include developing support services for students with special needs and establishing guidance and counselling capacity within the education system²². With such supports in place, some of the burden placed on teachers would then be alleviated. Additionally, trained personnel would be better equipped to meet the needs of children.

²² Concretely, the ESSP (MINEDUC, 2003c, p15) outlines strategies towards promoting the integration of special needs students and communicates the ongoing strategy to 'establish a division for Counselling and Guidance in MINEDUC, and in each province' (primary level, p18; secondary level, p21).

'I now see teaching as a lot more than simply imparting knowledge to young people. Since being in Rwanda, I've had to deal with lots of different things such as bullying, kids with family problems, kids who are very ill, general attitudes, etc. I now see education as a much broader and rounder concept.' (VSO female secondary school teacher)

Lack of support from parents and the community

However, teachers' perception is that this challenge is not recognised in the community. Relationships with parents, for instance, are sometimes non-existent, and where they do exist, they are often negative. For instance, parents seem to 'hand over' their children to the school, showing no ownership of their children's education. Parents do not always support the school's discipline rules, leaving teachers feeling unsupported and undermined. Thus, teachers do not have positive perceptions of parents, as this female primary school teacher notes:

'[What I don't like about teaching is] many alcoholic parents who don't follow up on their children's learning.'

Clearly, there needs to be a much stronger and more positive relationship between teachers, parents and communities. Parents, too, may have negative perceptions of teachers. Particularly in remote areas, teachers feel rejected by their communities. For instance, teachers are not included in ceremonies – they may even be refused entry at the door. Teachers in FGDs spoke openly about the reactions they received from parents and other community members:

'Yes, people mock teachers – both with words such as "Well, I could employ four teachers, or ten!" and with the way teachers are seen.' (Primary school teacher)

Schools need to establish strong links with the community, starting with positive home–school communication. The headteacher is the person who sets the tone for this kind of positive interaction. Through the PTA, parents can be encouraged to take greater ownership of their children's education. District-level leaders, who are respected by the community, can raise awareness and increase parental involvement in education. Finally, policy-level prioritisation in this area would provide training and funding for sensitisation activities.

Parents often cite distance from school as a main reason for the lack of communication with teachers and the school. Only through the building of new schools will students – and parents – have increased access to schools. Schools could also explore other ways of communicating with parents, such as on the radio, by letters and by holding outreach meetings.

'Parents' ownership of their children's education does not only imply financial participation. To illustrate this, 'communities' involvement in schools [includes] construction, management, supervision'. (MINEDUC, 2003b, EFA Plan of Action, p40)

Thus, home–school links could be promoted in terms of the parents' role in managing and supervising their children's education. Education is a shared responsibility as 'it takes a village to raise a child' (popular Rwandan saying).

Policy on community integration

To promote better relations between the school and the community, educational policy indicates the following:

- 'encourage greater parental participation in the efforts to educate their children, including school construction initiatives' (MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, p18)
- gradually reduce boarding (as this will bring teachers and parents closer together at secondary school level) (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p21)
- in general, strengthen PTAs
- the role of PTAs: 'Involve parents and communities including elected people responsible for education and PTAs in the management of the schools that serve them' (ESP p21).

What could be addressed more directly in the policy is the issue of positive discourse about teachers. The negative stereotypes must be overturned. For example, teachers often feel undervalued by being 'singled out' in the media:

'Politicians don't give teachers their true value. For example, on radio announcements for civil servants, they say "civil servants, even teachers" as though teachers aren't civil servants.' (FGD group/primary school teacher)

In general, teachers often feel like outsiders in the community. Positive discourse through positive messages about teachers from all authority levels – headteachers, district, provincial, national, media – would help to reverse the negative attitudes towards them. The teachers themselves have a role to play in this. Through their unions, they can speak as one voice to communicate positive messages about their profession. All stakeholders must contribute towards raising the status of teachers in the community by giving them unambiguous support.

'The Ministry needs to do everything possible to avoid this scorn of teachers, by giving them positive value.' (Future primary school teacher)

Many teachers spoke of an inferiority complex – sometimes even called the 'teachers' complex' – as one of the most influential demotivating factors in their work. The reasons cited for this complex include: poverty, not having qualifications, being scorned by society in general and perceiving they have no value in general. To alleviate these feelings of inferiority, these root causes of the 'complex' need to be addressed, at national level, but also in schools and communities.

Chapter 5: Strengthening the system

'No one recognises the value of a teacher even from the highest authority of a country up to the lowest one. And that is too much discouraging.' (Female future secondary school teacher)

Rwanda is undergoing a period of far-reaching and potentially transformative change in education, much of which is welcome. However, it is clear that reform priorities do not always respond to teachers' needs, and teachers experience difficulties associated with planning and communication, which they attribute to systemic weakness.

In this chapter, general higher-level issues – as voiced by teachers – that relate to the education system in Rwanda have been categorised as 'Strengthening the system'. These general issues are salient to a wide range of authorities in education:

- several levels of government (especially district, provincial and national)
- institutions within MINEDUC (such as the National Examinations Council (NEC), NCDC, the General Inspectorate)
- and, to some extent, donors and international agencies that play a significant role in education.

Perhaps because the decentralisation process is somewhat new in Rwanda, teachers perceive the government as one entity. In addition, central decision-making authority remains the responsibility of central government. For these reasons, 'Strengthening the system' is treated as one chapter in this report, and divided into four main categories:

1. managing change
2. capacity-building for decentralisation
3. communication
4. financing.

Managing change

'Authorities need to do something so that teachers will love their work. They should listen to them and give them the good resources for this country.' (Female primary school teacher)

'Changes [to the system] have made work more complicated because teachers were neither prepared nor consulted even though they are principal actors in reforms.' (Male secondary school teacher)

As discussed above, the education system in Rwanda is going through some unprecedented changes. Implementing change represents a tremendous challenge to governments everywhere, and Rwanda is no exception. In Rwanda, where 'there is still low capacity in the education sector, an urgent need for human and institutional capacity-building' (MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, pp16–17), prioritisation, coordination of efforts and communication are paramount to the process of change. A sector-wide approach (SWAp) has been adopted to ensure that changes take place in the most effective way possible. So far, teachers still feel inadequately prepared for these changes. This, it could be argued, is because, in some ways, they are at the 'end of the line' in terms of involvement and communication. This does not only mean including teachers in decisions and changes that affect them, even though this is clearly an important pre-requisite for positive change to occur. It means having a clear consultation process between the different stakeholders and an agreed plan of action and lines of responsibilities for the different actors involved. It also means strengthening the capacity of staff involved, especially as the policy of decentralisation is rolled out further.

Capacity-building for decentralisation

'All these changes make the workload heavier, except for decentralisation.' (Male secondary school teacher)

Teachers have mixed feelings about the decentralisation process, which often depends on their experiences. The process of decentralisation in Rwanda has been ongoing since 2000. Policy-makers and implementers, along with teachers, do recognise the need for capacity-building in this context, especially at non-national levels, along with clarification of roles in the implementation of decentralisation.

Decentralisation does not necessarily mean devolution of responsibility, and in Rwanda, the present form it takes is the deconcentration of administrative functions to provincial and district levels. One can infer from policy statements that true devolution – the passing of decision-making power and fiscal responsibility to lower levels of authority – may be a future step in the decentralisation process, but in the present policy framework most decision-making power rests with the central authorities. Nevertheless, there are some plans for capacity-building at more local levels, which would contribute to greater participation, responsibility and decision-making at those levels.

Communication

All processes of planning and change need to be communicated clearly to the public. Although communication and accountability are addressed in the next chapter of this report, the importance of this issue warrants mention here as well. Particular concerns of teachers that are related both to strengthening the system and to communication and accountability include:

- administration of pay (ie, being paid on time, backpay issued)
- consultation of teachers in decision-making, such as curriculum development
- delivering promises (ie, capitation grant, backpay).

‘Try to give salaries when promised – ie, on the 25th of each month. Sometimes salaries are 45 days late!’ (Secondary school teacher)

Efficient administration of pay (ie, being paid on time, backpay issued) will be enabled by provincial level capacity-building which, as already pointed out, is an essential component in the decentralisation process.

Consultation of teachers in decision-making needs to be a top priority for decision-makers. All levels of authorities should consult teachers regularly in decision-making processes and inform all teachers on how they have included them in the process. With effective, well-communicated implementation of policy, authorities can deliver promises.

A plan for improving management is outlined in the ESSP (MINEDUC, 2003c, p41), which begins with an intent to ‘identify “good practice” in management, then get operational manuals on institutional roles, detailed work programmes, identify competencies and needs, capacity-building assessment, follow-up...’ It is clear, from teachers’ perspectives, that improved management of the education system, particularly in relation to managing change such as the decentralisation process, will have an impact on their motivation and performance.

Financing

The positive changes that are both planned and ongoing throughout the education system have implications for financing. Change is costly and while the Rwandan Government has made it clear that education is a priority, further funds are needed to improve the quality of and access to education. With this in mind the government needs to continue to increase the education budget on a year-on-year basis, until the EFA goals are achieved. The donors also need to consider increasing aid to education to help the government with the costs of implementing the positive education plans.

Summary of teachers’ needs for a stronger education system

- Effective management of change, to prioritise:
 - provision of appropriate TLMs, especially textbooks
 - training (see Chapter 2: Supporting enhanced performance, earlier in this report)
 - class size (see Chapter 2: Supporting enhanced performance).

- Implementation of the decentralisation process, to include:
 - capacity-building, especially at non-national levels
 - clarification of roles and processes in decentralisation
 - definition of management.
- Communication and accountability in implementing policy:
 - administration of pay (ie, being paid on time, backpay issued)
 - inclusion of teachers in curriculum development
 - consultation of teachers in decision-making
 - delivery of promises by authorities (ie capitation grant, backpay)
 - accountability.
- Improved resourcing in education through:
 - increasing the education budget
 - donors increasing education aid budget
 - donors paying recurrent costs.

Chapter 6: Communication and accountability

'The State (government) does not even want to think about this situation, so I feel distressed that no one is looking after the problems that I meet in my teaching career.' (Male secondary school teacher)

Communication and accountability emerged as a theme that relates to all other issues raised in the 'Valuing Teachers' research. Teachers, not unlike Rwandan policy²³, clearly articulate the need for better communication and accountability among stakeholders in education. And with improved communication, they will be more aware of policies, processes and changes.

Communicating policy to teachers

'Something must be done to rectify the situation. Otherwise, we are heading for disaster as far as education in Rwanda is concerned.' (Male secondary school teacher)

Rwandan educational policy is new. It involves a sector-wide approach, involving numerous people at all levels of the sector. Even though policies are being implemented, teachers do not yet see or know the results. For example, teachers in FGDs did not know that a new curriculum would be coming out soon or that headteachers would be receiving training. Communicating progress in policy implementation directly to teachers would increase their trust and faith in changes.

For higher authorities to communicate effectively with teachers, strong coordination between these authorities is necessary. The policy intentions surrounding capacity-building at all levels of the education system in this area will enable good lines of communication from national to local level to be established and used to communicate more effectively with those on the 'front lines' of education.

In addition, decision-makers must prioritise actions that will ensure better communication, so teachers can trust that promises will be delivered and policies will be implemented, and not remain 'on paper' only.

'I hope that authorities will deliver what they promised. Do not consider teachers as blind. Niba ntacyo wamuha wikimubeshya. [If you have nothing to give him, don't deceive him.]' (Male primary school teacher)

If a project is delayed, teachers should be informed and told why so that their trust is maintained. The teachers interviewed recognise the limitations (especially financial) the education sector faces. Thus, their expectations may be reasonable. However, keeping promises or making improvements should be achievable and should therefore be a top priority.

'Teachers say that they are mistreated or underpaid, but the problem is that teachers do not have access to their pay card/salary breakdown (fiche de paye), which shows deductions like taxes etc. A teacher does not know his/her gross salary. If he/she did know that, then he/she could consider himself/herself as a worker for the State. But access to this information is denied.' (Primary school teacher)

The above quote illustrates one example where greater transparency and communication will also contribute towards improving the motivation of teachers. Access to information will be promoted through implementation of the plan 'to establish and publicise norms and standards'. (MINEDUC, 2003c, ESSP, p40)

²³For instance, 'Ensure constant and regular dialogue between the government and different partners, including donors, the private sector and civil society'. (MINEDUC, 2003a, ESP, p21)

Greater involvement for teachers in decision-making

Some teachers have contributed ideas to decision-making processes and, as this teacher mentions, have also made requests:

'School authorities on national level: for a long time, people have been asking for our opinions and remarks, but there is no tangible follow-up. I recommend that you make a tangible consequence. For example, we have submitted lists of what documents we need, but the materials are not forthcoming.' (Primary school teacher)

The overwhelming feeling expressed by teachers, however, is that they do not have a say in decision-making in education. For instance, teachers are not aware they should be consulted during curriculum development²⁴, because they do not perceive inclusion in the process. One interviewee said: 'Curriculum falls on us from above'. Clearly, there is a need for greater participation of teachers in all decision-making processes, especially in areas where they will play a direct classroom role, such as using the curriculum. This will help in ensuring policies are implemented at classroom level, as well as in developing trust.

To involve teachers in decision-making, authorities need to listen to them. A more emphatic commitment to this at policy level would strengthen 'vertical' communication lines, with the emphasis on 'bottom-up' communication.

Voices for teachers' views

Unions

To ensure teachers have a voice in policy dialogue, they must be encouraged to express their views. An effective union can provide them with a strong voice among stakeholders to communicate the realities at the 'front lines'.

'We need advocacy, a teachers' union.' (Male secondary school teacher)

At secondary level, there is presently no active union in the country. At primary level, however, one of SNEP's main short-term objectives is awareness-raising of the issues facing primary education – and primary teachers in particular – in Rwanda today. Communicating with teachers to build trust will contribute to building a voice for teachers. To complement this, continued collaboration with the government will allow for teacher–authority communication to be strengthened²⁵.

However, teachers do not yet fully understand or believe in the value of associations, such as a union:

'Associations have difficulties because of negative past experiences. For example there was a savings fund (caisse d'épargne) but it failed. The popular banks have difficulties compared to other banks. People don't want to join them. For instance, you can join a popular bank but it's difficult to close an account. It was six months for me!' (Secondary school teacher)

Headteachers

In addition to unions as representative of the teachers' voice and views, headteachers play a pivotal role in their communication and collaboration with other stakeholders in education, particularly parents and local leaders as the link to the PTA and to local government. They play a key role in ensuring effective communication at school and district levels, and should be trained to do so. They are also responsible for budgeting at school level. Teachers need trained, effective, accountable headteachers who will recognise their efforts and support their communication with other stakeholders.

²⁴The NCDC Primary and Secondary Curriculum Development Policy (MINEDUC, 2003e) does not list teachers among stakeholders in education in the first part of the document (p2); it explicitly states that teachers will be involved in the evaluation of curriculum (p6). To engage teachers in curriculum policy dialogue, and specifically in curriculum development, their role in the process could be more clearly defined and then communicated to teachers.

²⁵Narcisse Kayiranga emphasised the collaborative approach of the union, which is part of a broader Rwandese value of unity and reconciliation (interview, 23 September 2003).

District-level leaders

District-level leaders also need to be sensitised in order to play a role in parents' awareness-raising, as part of good communication among stakeholders. For instance, they could organise 'parents' days' at schools and strongly recommend that parents attend. FGD participants noted that because leaders are in a position of authority, they could solicit more parental attendance at meetings than a school-level invitation.

'In spite of efforts made in teaching, there is no recognition from the State or by school authorities who don't pay the bonus.' (Male secondary school teacher)

Communication among all stakeholders

Education is indeed a shared responsibility. The stakeholder meeting participants identified 24 organisations or categories of organisations involved in education in Rwanda today. Policy acknowledges the contribution of a wide variety of stakeholders and aims to promote effective communication among them. Teachers, who are rarely mentioned directly in examples of stakeholders, should figure more prominently and explicitly in policy documentation in order to increase their participation in decision-making processes.

'Teaching is an art. The State needs to encourage teachers. Also, here we must involve all education partners, such as parents, children and teachers.' (Male future secondary school teacher)

Summary of teachers' needs for improved communication and accountability

- Authorities to communicate with teachers on all processes and decisions, such as:
 - administration of pay
 - delays in administration
 - bicycles – delays
 - new policies and why they are being implemented
 - the potential for participation in decision-making process (ie, NCDC)
 - promotion possibilities.
- Involvement in decision-making:
 - clear communication of decisions from director level, with opportunities to participate clearly outlined.
 - NCDC–teacher involvement in curriculum development (inclusion of teachers in curriculum development)
 - authorities listen to and respond to teachers' identified needs as a follow-up to this report.
- headteachers to serve as a cornerstone of teachers' collaboration with other authorities, including:
 - PTA leadership
 - a community link
 - a district/provincial link
 - improving school ambience
 - financial management in school.
- an atmosphere of positive and proactive communication among stakeholders. Although teachers touched on this issue, other stakeholders were more explicit in underlining the importance of partnerships/networks, cost-sharing, and strengthening management as outlined in the EFA Plan of Action (p40):

'A strong network of stakeholders only possible through effective coordination and cooperation (including accountability).'

- INGO forum on education to be strengthened.

Conclusion and recommendations

'I did not choose teaching. However, when I got into it, I enjoyed it. Finally, it was my vocation. Yet I must note that the attitudes of authorities, of parents and even of students have made me change my mind.' (Female primary school teacher)

As this citation exemplifies, teachers' motivation is fragile in Rwanda. The act of teaching, that is to say classroom work, is often rewarding. However, the feelings of being neglected, ignored and even scorned by authorities and society are beginning to outweigh the positive moments with students. Teachers face difficulties at home and at work that leave them tired and demotivated. If policies are implemented in a communicative and timely way, and if teachers begin to feel valued in Rwandan society, this primary school teacher may just change her mind again, and become truly engaged in her vocation – teaching.

Recommendations

A. Attract and retain teachers in the profession

1. **Incentives/promotion:** a strong promotion and incentives system needs to be planned and implemented.
 - Teachers' salary must be raised by allowing increased recurrent costs.
 - An equitable incentives (salary and non-salary) needs to be studied and implemented.
 - A clear promotion system should be improved and implemented to attract and retain managers and teachers.
2. **Training:** strong prioritisation and coordination ensures quality pre-service and in-service training for teachers.
 - Better and more pre-service training should produce qualified teachers through revised NCDC curriculum and decentralisation.
 - Teacher training capacity at provincial and local levels needs to be increased through the decentralisation process.
 - In-service training programmes should be coordinated to ensure that training responds to needs and that teachers in all areas receive similar training.

B. Strengthen management of education system

3. **MINEDUC capacity-building:** institutions within MINEDUC (NEC/NCDC/General Inspectorate) need to be strengthened to implement policy effectively and quickly.
 - NCDC curriculum and textbook policy should be prioritised and implemented effectively.
 - National exams should match the curriculum and therefore be increasingly transparent.
 - A strengthened inspectorate will ensure effective communication among levels in education system.
4. **Decentralisation:** the decentralisation process should be clearly defined and strengthened to enable more effective service and local decision-making.
 - Policy definition should allow for increasing devolution and strong capacity-building at all levels, especially local, to ensure that responsibilities will be fulfilled.
 - Clear roles in decentralisation process need to be defined and implemented.
 - PTAs should be strengthened (training of headteacher, PTA).
5. **Communication and accountability among stakeholders:** improved networks and communication among stakeholders will help establish more local-level participation and trust in education.
 - Roles and responsibilities should be clarified throughout the education system and communicated to all.
 - Participation of a variety of stakeholders, including grassroots, needs to be ensured by prioritising: 'A horizontal coordination between different actors will be established, and there shall also be a stronger vertical link between central government, local government and grassroots groups.' (MINEDUC, 2003f, p8)

- 6. Management training:** prioritise and implement management training for headteachers.
- Prioritise and implement 'teaching management and administration to all teachers, and ensur[e]... that school heads regularly undergo special training' (MINEDUC, 2003f, p20).
 - MINEDUC and NGOs should play a role in designing and implementing (part-time/holiday) management training for headteachers.

C. Strengthen teachers' voice in the decision-making processes

- 7. Consulting teachers:** teachers should be explicitly mentioned as stakeholders in education throughout policy documentation, and implicated more thoroughly and consistently in decision-making processes.
- Policy-makers and other authorities need to listen to and respond to teacher needs.
 - Teachers need to be included in this work through a clear consultations process (ie, union representation, councils, workshops...).
 - Include teachers, especially in decision-making.
- 8. Voice of teachers through unions:** unions needs to be strengthened to represent a strong voice of teachers in policy dialogue.
- Unions should identify and communicate teachers' needs, through research and strong communication networks.
 - Unions should advocate for teachers on matters of teacher welfare and motivation.

Bibliography

Dakar Framework of Action (2000), *Education For All*, World Education Forum, Senegal

Fry, L (2002) *What Makes Teachers Tick? A policy research report on teacher motivation in developing countries*, London: VSO

McCall, J (2003) *The provision of textbooks for primary and secondary schools in Rwanda, 2003–2012*: Kigali: CfBT/Stoas

MINEDUC (2003a) *Education Sector Policy*, Republic of Rwanda: Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Scientific Research

MINEDUC (2003b) *Education For All Plan of Action*, Republic of Rwanda: Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Scientific Research

MINEDUC (2003c) *Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) 2004–2008*, Republic of Rwanda: Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Scientific Research

MINEDUC (2003d) *Vision 2020*, Republic of Rwanda: Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Scientific Research

MINEDUC (2003e) *NCDC Primary and Secondary School Curriculum Development Policy*, Republic of Rwanda: Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Scientific Research

MINEDUC (2003f) *NCDC 6 year plan: 2004–2009*, Republic of Rwanda: Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Scientific Research

MINEDUC/TECSULT (2003) *Renforcement du Système Éducatif Rwandais*, Montreal (Quebec): TECSULT internationale limité

MINEDUC (2002) *Rwanda Development Indicators 2000*, Kigali, Republic of Rwanda: Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Scientific Research

Rwanda Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, 2003

World Bank /Government of Rwanda country report (2003) *Education in Rwanda: Rebalancing Resources to Accelerate Post-Conflict Development and Poverty Reduction*

VSO (November 2003) 'Current Programme Snapshot'. Internal document prepared for the VSO Education Sector Review

Appendix 1: Focus group plans

Objective

By the end of this focus group discussion, participants will have identified and analysed various factors that affect their motivation as teachers. They will do this through structured, participatory activities in a context of confidentiality and trust.

Materials

- relatively quiet and private room needed
- chairs for all participants
- table space
- wall space (for chart paper)
- chart paper
- markers
- paper, photocopies
- post-it notes
- pens
- notebook.

Time

1–2 hours

Activities

Introduction

- presentation of researchers
- presentation of participants
- confidentiality (applying to researchers and participants)
- ground rules (one at a time, expressing and respecting opinions, confidentiality)
- types of activities to expect (participatory)
- objective of research (including definitions of terms 'morale', 'motivation' etc)
- drinks/snacks?

Activity 1

Objective: to identify teachers' overall job satisfaction (particularly motivation) in their working day.

Time: 15 minutes

Activity: in groups of two, go through a day, hour by hour, noting down activities that make you feel good about your job, or not so good. Write these things next to your timeline – to the left for happy, to the right for not happy. After all the groups have finished, they share their ideas with other groups.

Concluding activity: how motivated are you in your job? Rate on a scale of 1 to 10 (on back of sheet). How motivated are teachers, generally? Rate on a scale of 1 to 10 (on back of sheet).

Facilitator's role: circulates, then collects sheets at end.

Activity 2

Objective: to identify the profile of a satisfied, motivated teacher and to indicate whether a more motivated teacher is a more effective teacher.

Time: 15 minutes

Activity:

- On post-it notes, write down the characteristics of a satisfied teacher.
- Post the characteristics on the chart paper (with a happy face).
- On post-it notes, write down factors that make that teachers happy.
- Post the factors on the chart paper.
- Discuss the link between job satisfaction and effectiveness.

Facilitator's role:

- Encourage and model in post-it note activities.
- Collect the post-it notes after the activity.
- Lead discussion on the link between motivation and quality teaching.
- Note points of discussion.

Activity 3

Objective: to identify and analyse the factors that demotivate teachers in their job.

Time: 45 minutes

Activity:

- General: identify different categories of personal and professional life for teachers. This should be done in gender-segregated groups (male, female).
- In each category, brainstorm factors that contribute to poor teacher motivation.
- Classify factors in categories.
- Classify factors in order of importance
- Write down the level of influence of each factor: very strong, strong, weak, very weak etc.
- Discuss possible solutions.

Facilitator's role:

- Prompt the groups on the main issues to consider, as necessary:
 - HIV and AIDS
 - gender
 - genocide
 - salary
 - irregularities with 'dossiers'
 - transfers
 - suspension in case of illness
 - maternity leave
 - teachers' rights
 - family problems (ie, orphans, children)
 - living conditions
 - mutual fund/caisse
 - combating poverty project (by union)
 - combating AIDS project (by union)
 - language competency.
- **Conclusion:**
 - Recapitulate key activities done together.
 - Re-emphasise the importance of confidentiality and give assurance of confidentiality in the study.
 - Outline notes taken that could appear in the report.
 - Discuss any questions or comments about the day's activities.
 - Thank participants and close the session.

Appendix 2: Surveys

Survey for teachers: 'Valuing Teachers' research initiative by VSO

Dear Teacher,

Thank you for your time in completing this survey, which is a part of the 'Valuing Teachers' research initiative by VSO. The objective of this research is to analyse teachers' perceptions of their profession in order to help improve education. You will be asked questions about how you feel about being a teacher, including what kinds of things make your job easier or more difficult. The information gathered in this survey will enrich findings from discussion groups and interviews to be held across the country. Every person's confidentiality is guaranteed; this means that all information gathered is analysed on a group level and cannot be traced back to any individual. This will allow you to write frankly and openly about these issues that affect teachers. We do appreciate your assistance in this research.

Sincerely,

VSO Rwanda Research team

How long have you been a teacher? _____ years

How long have you been teaching in Rwanda? _____ years

What is your nationality? _____

Are you female or male? _____

What subject(s) do you teach? _____

Before starting teaching, what kind of pre-service training did you have?

| |
|--|
| |
| |

Since starting teaching in Rwanda, what in-service training have you had?

| |
|--|
| |
| |

What future career plans do you have? In other words, do you plan to remain in teaching or would you like to change to a different job? Why?

| |
|--|
| |
| |

How do you feel about being a teacher in Rwanda? Do you like your job? Why?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |

SEEN BUT NOT HEARD TEACHERS' VOICE IN RWANDA

What makes you happy as a teacher? (Name 3–5 things.)

| |
|--|
| |
| |

What makes you unhappy as a teacher? (Name 3–5 things.)

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |

How does the HIV and AIDS pandemic affect your work as a teacher?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |

What were your reasons for becoming a teacher? (Give 1–3 reasons.)

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Compare how you felt about teaching when you started in the profession to how you feel today. Do you find being a teacher now easier or more difficult than when you began?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

How have your feelings about being a teacher changed since you started teaching? Why?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |

The education system experiences changes over time: from curriculum to timetable changes to policies... Think about your career as a teacher in Rwanda. How have changes to the system affected you? (Some recent changes include new programmes of study, the trilingualism policy, the decentralisation process, a minimum of 25 hours per week of teaching classes, lower fail rates, the bicycle leasing initiative...)

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |

The next questions are about how your professional relationships with others make you feel as a teacher. For each category given below, please outline how these relationships make your job as a teacher easier or more difficult.

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Teacher–colleague relationships:

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Teacher–student relationships:

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Teacher–administration relationships (including the headteacher, the dean of studies and the discipline master):

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

SEEN BUT NOT HEARD TEACHERS' VOICE IN RWANDA

Relationships with local authorities (district level and provincial level):

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Relationships with national authorities (ie, MINEDUC):

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Relationships with parents and the community:

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Do your feelings about teaching influence how well you do it? In what way?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Do you think a happier teacher is a more effective teacher? Why?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Additional comments:

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |

Thank you again for your input!

Survey for teacher trainees: 'Valuing Teachers' research initiative by VSO

How long have you been studying to be a teacher? _____ years

When do you anticipate becoming a teacher? _____

What is your nationality? _____

Are you female or male? _____

What level and subject(s) will you teach? _____

How do think you will feel about being a teacher in Rwanda? Will you like your job? Why/why not?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |

What do you think will make you happy as a teacher? (Name 3-5 things.)

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |

What do you think will make you unhappy as a teacher? (Name 3-5 things.)

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |

How does the HIV and AIDS pandemic affect your future work as a teacher?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |

SEEN BUT NOT HEARD TEACHERS' VOICE IN RWANDA

What were your reasons for entering teacher training? (Give 1–3 reasons.)

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Was teacher training your first choice? Would you have preferred another academic choice? Which one(s)?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

What future career plans do you have? In other words, do you plan to remain in teaching or would you like to change to a different job? Why?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |

Do your feelings about teaching influence how well you will do it? In what way?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Do you think a happier teacher is a more effective teacher? Why?

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |

Additional comments:

| |
|--|
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |

Thank you again for your input!

Appendix 3: Stakeholders' meeting – attendance and programme

Stakeholders' meeting participants

| Name | Position | Organisation |
|---|---|-----------------------------|
| Sylvestre BIGIRABAGABO | Director | ES Rukozo |
| Mike DOUSE | Consultant | CfBT |
| Emma FANNING | Volunteer Teacher | Kayonza Secondary School |
| Phil HUDSON | Director | VSO Rwanda |
| Doutsen LANGHOUT | Volunteer Education Adviser | EER Kigeme |
| Dr Ephraim KANYARUKIGA | | Université Adventiste |
| Narcisse KAYIRANGA | President | SNEP |
| J Claude KWITONDA | Student | KIE |
| Theodore MBONEZA | Director Of Secondary Education | MINEDUC |
| Mike McRORY | EFA Adviser | CfBT |
| R Ezra MPYISI | | UNILAK |
| Venantie MUKAHIGIRO | Director | Ecole Primaire Kigeme |
| Thaddee MUKEZABATWARE | | ADRA |
| Nellie MUNALA | Programme Manager | VSO Rwanda |
| Aloysie MUREKEYISONI | Teacher | Ecole Secondaire de Kayonza |
| Joseph MURWANYI | | MINEDUC |
| J AKATO BAKUNZI | | MINEDUC |
| Emmanuel NDAYISENGA | | KIE |
| Ildephonse NGILINSHUTI | Vice President | SNEP |
| Johnson NTAGARAMBA (Guest of Honour) | Director of Teacher Management and Development | MINEDUC |
| H RUBONEKA | | MINEDUC |
| Harvey SMITH | Consultant Coordinator | CfBT |
| Gary STEWART | Volunteer Education Adviser | SNEC |
| Facilitators/Observers | | |
| Martin BUTARAMA (Interpreter) | Interpreter | Independent |
| Sue BUTCHART (Interpreter) | Programme Manager | VSO Rwanda |
| Sally GEAR (Observer) | Programme Development Adviser | VSO London |
| Ruth MBABAZI (Facilitator) | Programme Manager | VSO Rwanda |
| Hassan NSENGIYUMVA (Interpreter) | HIV and AIDS Coordinator | VSO Rwanda |
| Catherine STANLEY (Observer) | Programme Development Adviser | VSO London |
| Thomas REED (Facilitator) | Volunteer Researcher | VSO Rwanda |
| Lucy TWEEDIE (Guest Speaker) | Senior Advocacy Officer | VSO London |

Stakeholders' meeting agenda

Tuesday 18 November, 2003
Nyarutarama Tennis Club

| | |
|----------|--|
| 9:30 am | <i>Arrival of guests, registration, coffee/tea</i> |
| 10:00 am | Opening ceremony |
| 10:20 am | Introduction to the 'Valuing Teachers' research |
| 10:45 am | Presentation of initial findings in Rwanda |
| 11:15 am | Group work: problem trees |
| 12:45 pm | Brainstorm stakeholders in education |
| 1:00 pm | <i>Lunch break</i> |
| 2:00 pm | <i>Solutions to problems/recommendations</i> |
| 3:00 pm | <i>Closing ceremony</i> |

For a full report of the stakeholders' meeting, please contact the VSO Rwanda programme office.

Appendix 4: Inputs and outputs

